

**ADVANCED GCE****HISTORY**

Historical Investigations 768–1216

2587

Candidates answer on the Answer Booklet

OCR Supplied Materials:

- 12 page Answer Booklet

Other Materials Required:

None

Monday 8 June 2009**Morning****Duration: 1 hour 30 minutes****INSTRUCTIONS TO CANDIDATES**

- Write your name clearly in capital letters, your Centre Number and Candidate Number in the spaces provided on the Answer Booklet.
- Use black ink. Pencil may be used for graphs and diagrams only.
- Read each question carefully and make sure that you know what you have to do before starting your answer.
- Do **not** write in the bar codes.

INFORMATION FOR CANDIDATES

- The number of marks is given in brackets [] at the end of each question or part question.
- The total number of marks for this paper is **90**.
- This paper contains questions on the following two Options:
 - Charlemagne (pages 2–3)
 - King John (pages 4–5)
- Answer on **one** Option only. In that Option, answer the question on the Passages and **one** other question.
- You should write in continuous prose and are reminded of the need for clear and accurate writing, including structure of argument, grammar, punctuation and spelling.
- The time permitted allows for reading the Passages in the one Option you have studied.
- You are advised to spend equal time on the Passages question and the essay you select.
- In answering the Passages question, you are expected to use your knowledge of the topic to help you explain and evaluate the interpretations in the Passages, as well as to inform your answers.
- In answering the essay question, you are expected to refer to and evaluate relevant interpretations to help you develop your arguments.
- This document consists of **8** pages. Any blank pages are indicated.

Charlemagne

If answering this Option, candidates **MUST** answer **Question 1** and **ONE** other question.

1 Study all the Passages.

Using these **four** Passages **and** your own knowledge, assess the view that Charlemagne's promotion of learning and culture was driven by his own personal interest. **[45]**

- A** From: C. W. Previté Orton, *Outlines of Medieval History*, published in 1916. This historian sees a real cultural 'Renaissance' driven by Charlemagne.

The literary and artistic Renaissance which was coming about in the West under Charlemagne made theological activity possible. The king, who loved learning and art although he could not read, spared no pains to revive them. The Lombard Paulus Diaconus and far more the Northumbrian Alcuin were his chief helpers. Alcuin founded a school of Frankish writers and theologians, who could write the corrected Latin of the West. Even handwriting was reformed and improved. At the same time a revival of the arts took place, which is most noticeable in architecture. Churches, elaborately built and adorned with mosaics, of which the most famous is the cathedral in Charlemagne's favourite residence of Aachen, began to arise. Native Frankish genius was stimulated and prompted by Italian-Byzantine and oriental influences.

5

10

- B** From: H. Fichtenau, *The Carolingian Empire*, published in 1957. This historian is a vigorous critic of the achievements.

When all is considered, we must conclude that the cultural life of the Franks was far removed from a true 'Renaissance' of classical antiquity. True, Carolingian scholars saved much of the previous inheritance of classical antiquity and transformed it to later generations. But such work was not done for its own sake. It was done in the belief that worldly knowledge was a useful servant of theology. This criticism does not detract from the real significance of the court scholars; for their achievement as the preservers and transmitters of a cultural inheritance was quite extraordinary. Yet it must be admitted that none of these men can be counted amongst the great as intellectuals.

15

20

- C** From: P. D. King, *Charlemagne*, published in 1986. This historian thinks that Charlemagne had several motives for encouraging education, above all in the service of theology.

Francia under Charlemagne knew unprecedented scholarly activity, and for this the king was chiefly responsible. His own enthusiasm for and his pursuit of learning is particularly evident. And he promoted education, ordering every monastery and even every bishopric to provide free schools. Charlemagne established an enduring association between good rulership and the fostering of intellectual life, to Europe's immeasurable benefit. Charlemagne was intent upon the reshaping of society in accordance with the beliefs of Christianity, and knowledge was essential to the attainment of this objective. The prime source of such knowledge was the Bible. Hence the scholarly concern with correct Latin, for the literal word of God in the Bible must not be spoiled by error or be misunderstood.

25

30

- D** From: Rosamond McKitterick, *The Carolingian Renaissance of Culture and Learning*, published in 2005. This historian sees a variety of factors at work in Charlemagne's cultural activities.

Charlemagne and his immediate successors expended their wealth and exploited their superior position in order to serve their intellectual interests, enrich their libraries and enhance their pleasure. Yet Carolingian royal patronage was not solely directed towards selfish ends. Close examination of the king's personal intervention and promotion of scholarship indicate that the patronage of learning was an obligation for the king. Royal patronage was not random aesthetic pleasure, but an organised and determined assembly and deployment of resources to carry out the specific aims expressed in the royal capitularies. The Carolingian ruler sustained groups of artists, scribes and craftsmen over a long period of time in order to create artefacts for his particular objectives. His patronage was designed to promote his royal power as a Christian king and to consolidate the Christian faith by disseminating the key texts on which that faith was based.

35

40

Answer **either**

- 2** Assess the reasons why Charlemagne was so often at war. **[45]**

or

- 3** 'Charlemagne's personality held together his Empire far more than any developed administrative system.' How far do you agree? **[45]**

Candidates are reminded that they must refer to and evaluate relevant interpretations in developing the argument in their essay.

King John

If answering this Option, candidates **MUST** answer **Question 4** and **ONE** other question.

4 Study all the Passages.

Using these **four** Passages **and** your own knowledge, assess the view that King John's quarrel with Innocent III over the Canterbury election lasted so long because the Interdict had a limited impact upon England. **[45]**

- A** From: W. Stubbs, *The Constitutional History of England*, published in 1880. Stubbs is very critical of King John and blames him for the quarrel.

After the death of Archbishop Hubert Walter in July 1205 John became engaged in a quarrel from which a little thought would have saved him. He chose to challenge Innocent III; matching his own low cunning at once against the skilful diplomacy of the Roman Court and the greatest of all the popes. Foiled in his attempt to place his own choice on the throne of Canterbury, and unwilling to agree to a compromise, he refused to receive the newly-consecrated archbishop and exposed the country to the shame and horrors of an interdict. The spring of 1213 saw the close of this struggle. John trembled at the papal excommunication. In terrible alarm he surrendered every point for which he had been struggling.

5

- B** From: A. L. Poole, *From Domesday Book to Magna Carta 1087–1216*, published in 1951. This historian argues that the impact of Papal measures was limited for some time.

The severity with which the interdict was enforced may have varied in different localities, and among different religious bodies. It may be assumed that the interdict caused grave discomfort, and that, for the religiously-minded, life in these conditions can have been scarcely tolerable. Yet it was endured for more than six years. John gave his answer to the impending interdict. He issued instructions for the confiscation of the property of the clergy, both monastic and secular, who were unwilling to celebrate the divine office. These sweeping orders were probably meant to be only short-term, pending a sorting out of the churches which whole-heartedly supported papal authority from those which were ready to accede to 'royal custom'. In the course of the next fortnight separate arrangements were made with the various ecclesiastical bodies. The evidence of ecclesiastical records seems to indicate that churches and monasteries, apart from the suspension of church rites, carried on much as usual, farming their estates and even adding to them by the receipt of alms and gifts of property.

10

15

20

- C** From: R. V. Turner, *King John*, published in 1994. The historian argues why John was eventually forced to negotiate a settlement after holding out for some time.

The King's excommunication failed to make much impact on England. John experienced little concern. A great council of barons ratified King John's stand that a papal guarantee for royal rights must be a part of any settlement. If anything, the interdict and excommunication strengthened King John's political position by separating two powerful groups – church and baronage – capable of mounting political opposition. Innocent III never anticipated that John could hold out for so long. He had miscalculated, perhaps misled by the king's willingness throughout the interdict to negotiate. Possibly he failed to realise how much the king's enjoyment of the flow of the Church's wealth into his treasury dampened his enthusiasm for peace. Negotiations went on intermittently throughout the interdict, and they resumed in autumn 1212, with an embassy sent by John to Rome. The king's circumstances

25

30

had worsened with wide discontent that summer, even a conspiracy among some of his barons. 35

- D** From: C. Harper-Bill, *John and the Church of Rome*, published in 1999. This historian suggests John made money from the interdict while the church administration continued.

John's response to the Interdict was the imposition of economic sanctions. The direct administration by the Crown of the revenues of all the monasteries, let alone of some nine thousand parish churches, was obviously totally impossible. The vast majority of the English clergy paid a fine to the Crown for the privilege of administering their own estates. All the clergy of England suffered financially, but there is no indication that they were driven to penury. Apart from the majority of the bishops, who felt it prudent to leave the country between 1209 and 1213 when the king himself was excommunicate, there were very few clerical refugees, dozens rather than hundreds. John certainly profited financially from the Interdict. 40 45

Despite the removal of almost all the diocesan bishops, either by death or by exile, the routine administration of the church did not grind to a halt. Benefices were filled as they fell vacant, even if the incumbent was unable for the time being to fulfil his most important role. The church courts continued to sit. The rolls of the king's court provide evidence for continued royal dealings with them. The mechanisms of ecclesiastical government were still fully in place when the Interdict was lifted. 50

Answer **either**

- 5** Assess the view that John's poor leadership was the **main** reason why he failed to regain his French lands after 1204. [45]

or

- 6** 'The breakdown of King John's relations with his barons after the acceptance of Magna Carta was solely the fault of the King.' How far do you agree? [45]

Candidates are reminded that they must refer to and evaluate relevant interpretations in developing the argument in their essay.

BLANK PAGE

BLANK PAGE

**Copyright Information**

OCR is committed to seeking permission to reproduce all third-party content that it uses in its assessment materials. OCR has attempted to identify and contact all copyright holders whose work is used in this paper. To avoid the issue of disclosure of answer-related information to candidates, all copyright acknowledgements are reproduced in the OCR Copyright Acknowledgements Booklet. This is produced for each series of examinations, is given to all schools that receive assessment material and is freely available to download from our public website (www.ocr.org.uk) after the live examination series.

If OCR has unwittingly failed to correctly acknowledge or clear any third-party content in this assessment material, OCR will be happy to correct its mistake at the earliest possible opportunity.

For queries or further information please contact the Copyright Team, First Floor, 9 Hills Road, Cambridge CB2 1PB.

OCR is part of the Cambridge Assessment Group; Cambridge Assessment is the brand name of University of Cambridge Local Examinations Syndicate (UCLES), which is itself a department of the University of Cambridge.