



**General Certificate of Education
June 2012**

Classical Civilisation 1021

Women in Athens and Rome

AS Unit 1D

Final

Mark Scheme

Mark schemes are prepared by the Principal Examiner and considered, together with the relevant questions, by a panel of subject teachers. This mark scheme includes any amendments made at the standardisation meeting attended by all examiners and is the scheme which was used by them in this examination. The standardisation meeting ensures that the mark scheme covers the students' responses to questions and that every examiner understands and applies it in the same correct way. As preparation for the standardisation meeting each examiner analyses a number of students' scripts: alternative answers not already covered by the mark scheme are discussed at the meeting and legislated for. If, after this meeting, examiners encounter unusual answers which have not been discussed at the meeting they are required to refer these to the Principal Examiner.

It must be stressed that a mark scheme is a working document, in many cases further developed and expanded on the basis of students' reactions to a particular paper. Assumptions about future mark schemes on the basis of one year's document should be avoided; whilst the guiding principles of assessment remain constant, details will change, depending on the content of a particular examination paper.

Further copies of this Mark Scheme are available to download from the AQA Website: www.aqa.org.uk

Copyright © 2012 AQA and its licensors. All rights reserved.

COPYRIGHT

AQA retains the copyright on all its publications. However, registered schools and colleges for AQA are permitted to copy material from this booklet for their own internal use, with the following important exception: AQA cannot give permission to schools and colleges to photocopy any material that is acknowledged to a third party even for internal use within the schools and colleges.

Set and published by the Assessment and Qualifications Alliance.

INTRODUCTION

The information provided for each question is intended to be a guide to the kind of answers anticipated and is neither exhaustive nor prescriptive. **All appropriate responses should be given credit.**

Where Greek and Latin terms appear in the Mark Scheme, they do so generally for the sake of brevity. Knowledge of such terms, other than those given in the specification, is **not** required. However, when determining the level of response for a particular answer, examiners should take into account any instances where the student uses Greek or Latin terms effectively to aid the clarity and precision of the argument.

Information in round brackets is not essential to score the mark.

DESCRIPTIONS OF LEVELS OF RESPONSE

The following procedure must be adopted in marking by levels of response:

- read the answer as a whole
- work down through the descriptors to find the one which best fits
- determine the mark from the mark range associated with that level, judging whether the answer is nearer to the level above or to the one below.

Since answers will rarely match a descriptor in all respects, examiners must allow good performance in some aspects to compensate for shortcomings in other respects. Consequently, the level is determined by the 'best fit' rather than requiring every element of the descriptor to be matched. Examiners should aim to use the full range of levels and marks, taking into account the standard that can reasonably be expected of students after one year of study on the Advanced Subsidiary course and in the time available in the examination.

Students are **not** necessarily required to respond to all the bullet points in order to reach Level 5 or Level 4, but they should cover a sufficient range of material to answer the central aspects of the question.

QUALITY OF WRITTEN COMMUNICATION

The Quality of Written Communication will be taken into account in all questions worth 10 or more marks. This will include the student's ability

- to communicate clearly, ensuring that text is legible and that spelling, punctuation and grammar are accurate
- to select and use an appropriate form and style of writing, and
- to organise information clearly and coherently, using specialist vocabulary when appropriate.

LEVELS OF RESPONSE FOR QUESTIONS WORTH 10 MARKS

Level 4	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none">• accurate and relevant knowledge covering central aspects of the question• clear understanding of central aspects of the question• ability to put forward an argument which for the most part has an analytical and/or evaluative focus appropriate to the question and uses knowledge to support opinion• ability generally to use specialist vocabulary when appropriate.	9-10
Level 3	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none">• a range of accurate and relevant knowledge• some understanding of some aspects of the question• some evidence of analysis and/or evaluation appropriate to the question• some ability to use specialist vocabulary when appropriate.	6-8
Level 2	Demonstrates either <ul style="list-style-type: none">• a range of accurate and relevant knowledge or <ul style="list-style-type: none">• some relevant opinions with inadequate accurate knowledge to support them.	3-5
Level 1	Demonstrates either <ul style="list-style-type: none">• some patchy accurate and relevant knowledge or <ul style="list-style-type: none">• an occasional attempt to make a relevant comment with no accurate knowledge to support it.	1-2

LEVELS OF RESPONSE FOR QUESTIONS WORTH 20 MARKS

Level 5	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none">• well chosen accurate and relevant knowledge covering most of the central aspects of the question• coherent understanding of the central aspects of the question• ability to sustain an argument which<ul style="list-style-type: none">has an almost wholly analytical and/or evaluative focus,responds to the precise terms of the question,effectively links comment to detail,has a clear structurereaches a reasoned conclusionis clear and coherent, using appropriate, accurate language andmakes use of specialist vocabulary when appropriate.	19-20
Level 4	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none">• generally adequate accurate and relevant knowledge covering many of the central aspects of the question• understanding of many of the central aspects of the question• ability to develop an argument which<ul style="list-style-type: none">has a generally analytical and/or evaluative focus,is broadly appropriate to the question,mainly supports comment with detail andhas a discernible structureis generally clear and coherent, using appropriate, generally accurate language andgenerally makes use of specialist vocabulary when appropriate.	14-18
Level 3	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none">• a range of accurate and relevant knowledge• some understanding of some aspects of the question• some evidence of analysis and/or evaluation appropriate to the question• some ability to structure a response using appropriate language, although with some faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar• some ability to use specialist vocabulary when appropriate.	9-13
Level 2	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none">• either a range of accurate and relevant knowledge• or some relevant opinions with inadequate accurate knowledge to support them• and sufficient clarity, although there may be more widespread faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar.	5-8
Level 1	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none">• either some patchy accurate and relevant knowledge• or an occasional attempt to make a relevant comment with no accurate knowledge to support it• and little clarity; there may be widespread faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar.	1-4

LEVELS OF RESPONSE FOR QUESTIONS WORTH 30 MARKS

Level 5	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • well chosen accurate and relevant knowledge covering most of the central aspects of the question • coherent understanding of the central aspects of the question • ability to sustain an argument which <ul style="list-style-type: none"> has an almost wholly analytical and/or evaluative focus, responds to the precise terms of the question, effectively links comment to detail, has a clear structure reaches a reasoned conclusion is clear and coherent, using appropriate, accurate language and makes use of specialist vocabulary when appropriate. 	27-30
Level 4	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • generally adequate accurate and relevant knowledge covering many of the central aspects of the question • understanding of many of the central aspects of the question • ability to develop an argument which <ul style="list-style-type: none"> has a generally analytical and/or evaluative focus, is broadly appropriate to the question, mainly supports comment with detail has a discernible structure is generally clear and coherent, using appropriate, generally accurate language and generally makes use of specialist vocabulary when appropriate. 	20-26
Level 3	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • a range of accurate and relevant knowledge • some understanding of some aspects of the question • some evidence of analysis and/or evaluation appropriate to the question • some ability to structure a response using appropriate language, although with some faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar • some ability to use specialist vocabulary when appropriate. 	13-19
Level 2	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • either a range of accurate and relevant knowledge • or some relevant opinions with inadequate accurate knowledge to support them • and writes with sufficient clarity, although there may be more widespread faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	7-12
Level 1	Demonstrates <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • either some patchy accurate and relevant knowledge • or an occasional attempt to make a relevant comment with no accurate knowledge to support it • and little clarity; there may be widespread faults of spelling, punctuation and grammar. 	1-6

This page has been left intentionally blank

Mark Scheme
Unit 1D Women in Athens and Rome

Section 1

Option A

01 When had Eratosthenes first seen Euphiletus' wife?

(Euphiletus' mother's) funeral [1]

(1 mark)

02 What had the maid done to help Eratosthenes start the affair?

acted as go-between / passed on messages [1]

(1 mark)

03 Describe what Euphiletus said happened on a later occasion after the maid told him that Eratosthenes was in the house. Give three details.

THREE of e.g. Euphiletus told her to watch door [1] and leave it open [1] Euphiletus crept downstairs / out [1] collected witnesses [1] got torches (from shop) [1] forced bedroom door [1] Eratosthenes lying beside wife [1] stood up naked [1] Euphiletus knocked him down (with one blow) [1] tied arms behind back [1] asked why committing crime [1] Eratosthenes admitted guilt [1] offered money [1] begged not be killed [1] Euphiletus killed him [1] claiming it was in accordance with laws [1] etc.

(3 marks)

04 'In his defence speech, Euphiletus presents himself as both a good husband and a good citizen.' To what extent do you agree? Give the reasons for your views and support them with details from the speech.

Judgements may be supported by discussion of a range (but **not** necessarily all) of e.g.

- husband: at start of marriage, watched her 'as proper', but did not want to annoy her; trusted her after birth of son and showed affection by putting her in charge of all his property and had no suspicions about her chastity; turned household arrangements upside down to stop risk of her going downstairs to bathe baby; tolerated her locking him in upstairs room, getting light from neighbour, wearing make-up after death of brother; however, does imply he was too trusting; happy to repeat her gibe about his activities with maid, presumably because even if true would not have reflected badly on him in eyes of jury etc.
- citizen: immediate action when informed by hag of Eratosthenes' serial adulteries; gathered witnesses who could swear that the prosecution's version of events was false; refused Eratosthenes' offer of money allegedly making speech that in killing him he was administering the law; had 2 versions of Solon's law read out to show he was acting in interests of whole community not just himself; by discussing at some length Solon's motives, drew attention away from questions about how premeditated his actions were and confused what law allowed and what it compelled; final appeal based on injustice of his predicament and seriousness of risk he faces etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(10 marks)

05 How important were children to an Athenian marriage? Give the reasons for your views and support them with details from the sources you have studied.

You might include discussion of

- *the purposes of marriage in Athens*
- *laws about citizenship and inheritance*
- *Euphiletus' speech from which the passage is taken*
- *Apollodorus' speech about Neaera and her alleged daughter Phano*
- *the speech about Ciron's daughter*
- *Ischomachus' conversation with Socrates*
- *Aristophanes' Women at the Thesmophoria.*

Judgements may be supported by discussion of a range (but **not** necessarily all) of **e.g.**

- Important purpose of marriage to produce legitimate heirs to inherit; only legitimate males could inherit / become citizens, subject to approval of phratry / deme; other purposes to preserve / enhance economic well-being and status of *oikos* and to provide care for parents in old age; in competitive, honour-based society, procreation of legitimate children increased prestige etc.
- Euphiletus claims birth of son turning point in relationship with wife; previously had treated her with caution, but after birth trusted her with care of his property; presumably expected jury to understand this change in their relationship; her living downstairs justified by the better care this would enable her to give baby, a motive with which he presumably expected jury to sympathise even if actual arrangements ran counter to social norms and made possible adultery; takes great care to ensure baby's legitimacy not questioned by dating start of adultery precisely some time after birth etc.
- Theogenes seems to have married Phano more in order to secure financial backing from Stephanus for year as King Archon; however, birth of child of great importance to Phrastor – hated relatives who did not want to inherit – divorced Phano when pregnant when questions raised about her status, but tried to introduce baby to phratry when believed he was terminally ill, and remarried as soon as recovered in order to produce uncontroversial heir etc.
- speech about Ciron's daughter shows how inheritance and status tied up with demonstrably legitimate birth etc.
- Ischomachus' conversation with Socrates focuses more on economical and managerial role of wife because of Socrates' initial question, but assumption that children will be born subject to gods' approval so that parents can be looked after in old age; Ischomachus' outrage at wife wearing make-up and high boots because of his anxieties about her attracting external male gaze and compromising legitimacy; analogy of leader bee includes role of bringing up young; children sufficiently important for Ischomachus to claim they will consult together on their upbringing etc.
- *Women at the Thesmophoria*: all participants appear to have had children; Mnesilochus' prayer concerning 'her' imaginary children and speech; scene with Mica's 'baby' etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(20 marks)

Option B

- 06 Explain how women would benefit if Valerius' 'motion' (line 1) were passed. Make three points.**

repeal of Oppian Law [1] law passed during war with Hannibal [1] which limited gold women could wear (to half ounce) [1] prohibited them from wearing purple / multi-coloured dresses [1] forbade riding in carriage in / within 1 mile of Rome (unless at religious festival) [1] (without these restrictions) women would be able to enjoy prosperity of peace [1] would be equal to wives of Latin allies [1] would not be dressed as if in mourning [1] would not be worse dressed than horses [1] etc.

(3 marks)

- 07 What had the women done which Cato described as 'womanish rebellion' (line 7)? Make two points.**

TWO of e.g. disobeyed husbands [1] have left home [1] blocked streets [1] and entrance to Forum [1] lobbied men coming into Forum [1] solicited officials / consuls / praetors [1] argued they should have their luxuries back [1] as economy thriving [1] broke ancestral rule that women should be subject to male guardian [1] meddled in politics [1] etc.

(2 marks)

- 08 How far was Valerius' attitude towards women different from Cato's? Give the reasons for your views and support them with details from the two speeches.**

Judgements may be supported by discussion of a range (but **not** necessarily all) of e.g.

- Cato: outraged by women's public protest; thinks women should not conduct any business without guardian in accordance with tradition and should not meddle in public affairs; fears that once women given a little freedom will run out of control and seek to dominate; also fears their extravagance; believes law necessary to curb their instincts since husbands could not do it without law etc.
- Valerius: apparently less chauvinistic / misogynistic, more modern by western standards and sympathetic – lists occasions (Sabines, Coriolanus, Gauls, Idaean Mother, Hannibal – all crises) when women have intervened for Rome's benefit and shown strength, initiative, determination; argues women deserve fruits of victory as much as men, should not be criticised for intervening in matters which affect them, terms of Oppian Law unjust in comparison with rights of Latin allies' wives; but patronising by modern standards and like Cato believes women should not in normal circumstances intervene in men's world – argues women lived for centuries with highest standards of behaviour without compulsion of law, clothes area in which women excel / take pride, women upset more easily than men, women enjoy being under men's control, and hate widowhood, men should exercise authority over women, not mastery, and do so with respect / moderately etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(10 marks)

09 *How varied are the criticisms made about Roman women in the extracts which you have read? Give the reasons for your views and support them with details from the sources.*

You might include discussion of

- *the purposes each author had*
- *the tone and content of the criticisms*
- *Cato's speech in the debate from which the passage comes*
- *Sallust's description of Sempronia*
- *Cicero's portrayal of Clodia*
- *the views expressed in Juvenal's Satire 6.*

Judgements may be supported by discussion of a range (but **not** necessarily all) of **e.g.**

- Livy's *History* had moral purpose in line with Augustan values and Cato's speech either invented or worked up by Livy to make dramatic contrast with Valerius' and to reflect concerns about women current in own day; Cato portrayed as arguing on basis of what he perceives to be traditional values / ancestral custom seeing the past as a sort of Golden Age; fears women's lack of judgement, lack of self-control, extravagance etc.
- Clodia: Cicero's portrayal from forensic speech in defence of Caelius, but rather than defend Caelius Cicero denigrates Clodia, sister of personal enemy; entertains jury, serving on public holiday when they could have been at theatre, with malicious portrait that is enhanced by acting parts that draw on common stereotypes, especially women's propensity for sexual licence, and show her to fail both by ancient (Caecus') and modern (Clodius') standards; Cicero allows Clodia no positive virtues – fails to live up to standards of family (e.g. Vestal Quinta Claudia), lacks all fundamental qualities of *matrona*, being unchaste, adulterous, incestuous with brother, participating in orgies, parading with other women's husbands on Via Appia, making trips to notorious resort of Baiae and spying from house on young men bathing in Tiber; her prosecution of Caelius trivialised as simply the malicious revenge of a jilted lover etc.
- Sempronia: used by Sallust in historical monograph as female example of Rome's moral decline parallel to Catiline; despite her potential (good breeding, education etc.) failed to live up to traditional expectations and showed neither domestic qualities nor those of males in her family (cf. Clodia); out of husband's control (cf. Cato's criticisms), lacking traditional qualities of frugality because extravagant and in debt and chastity because debauched (like Clodia) with criminal record and meddling in public affairs by aiding Catiline's revolution by inciting slaves, burning city, winning over / killing husbands etc.
- Juvenal: claims to be giving advice to young man about to marry but absurdly exaggerated satire with manic list of criticisms based on traditional male fears and stock jokes e.g. women's deceit, untrustworthiness, sexual depravity, imitating / meddling in men's activities and attempting to be superior; complete lack of balance (even Cornelia criticised for snobbery) black and white contrast between present and past (cf. Cato) and simplistic explanation of reasons for alleged decline (cf. Sallust); exaggeration with use of sharp vivid images and examples piled up in quick succession to imply there is no limit to female vice (cf. Cicero on Clodia) – over-developed sex-drive and under-developed marital devotion of Eppia and Messalina, devious mothers-in-law, litigious and athletic women, women who misuse their education to humiliate men, tricks to achieve sterility / abortion and so on in a frenzied whirlwind of hate and disgust etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(20 marks)

Section 2

Option C

- 10 **How important to the comic effect of Aristophanes' *Women at the Thesmophoria* is confusion between male and female roles and how important are other sources of humour? Give the reasons for your views.**

You might include discussion of

- **women behaving like men and taking on their roles**
- **men behaving like women**
- **men being treated like women**
- **how clear the distinctions between male and female behaviour were in real life, according to lawcourt speeches and *Ischomachus***
- **other sources of comedy in *Women at the Thesmophoria*.**

Judgements may be supported by discussion of a range (but **not** necessarily all) of **e.g.**

- in Athens free males and females had clearly differentiated roles, particularly in higher classes; women played no direct part in political and legal processes; assigned particular roles in caring for dead and in religious rituals; in *oikos*, ideally had clearly defined role managing internal affairs (alluded to by Mica 'on our side of the house', emphasised by *Ischomachus*, taken for granted by *Euphiletus*) with separate part of house allocated to them (even if norm reversed by *Euphiletus*) etc.
- plot depends on absurdity of women abandoning their serious religious role on day of fasting / mourning at *Thesmophoria* (on which perhaps to male eyes nothing much happened) and with mimicry of formalities of male assembly debating *Euripides'* punishment for supposedly slandering them in his plays (although subsequent parodies of *Helen* and *Andromeda* show women as victims rather than villains)
- in *Women at the Thesmophoria* humour depends on confusion not just between male and female but between myth / fictional world of theatre and reality – some myths embodied male fears about women, but although they may have not only reflected but also reinforced male attitudes towards women, obviously absurd that *Euripides'* dramatisations would have directly affected some of the trivia Mica talks about, especially as several of *Euripides'* surviving plays give rather sympathetic portrait of heroines otherwise portrayed hostilely etc.
- portrayal of *Agathon* continues absurdity by mixing distorted reality and drama in extended joke, based on his good, and so assumed to be feminine, looks and thus female sexual behaviour, and cross-dressing in order to write a convincing female part etc.
- *Euripides*, tragic playwright, takes on stereotypical tragic hero's role at mercy of women's revenge, leading to extended scene of cross-dressing *Mnesilochus*, absurdly including singeing of pubic hair and with ludicrous effect, to infiltrate *Thesmophoria* (in reality a serious taboo) though not noticed by women, and subsequent undressing following intervention of *Cleisthenes* regularly mocked for beardlessness and so assumed sexual ambiguity etc.
- in line with comic expectations, generally portrays women according to conventions of chauvinistic stereotypes (duplicitous, addicted to extravagance, drink, sex etc.) which reflect at a more mundane level male fears of women's potential to destroy *oikos* which are shown at a more elevated level in some tragedies etc.; *Aristophanes'* humour is often working at more than one level e.g. *Mnesilochus'* sacrifice of Mica's wineskin baby gets its effect as much from the ingenious parody of *Telephus* as from its portrayal of

her as an alcoholic; Mnesilochus delivers series of far-fetched examples of women's deceitful and subversive behaviour, comically causing outrage among women, not because false but because Mnesilochus disclosing them; in their subsequent treatment of Mnesilochus, women attempt to be as vindictive as their counterparts in tragedy, but are dependent on men to achieve their goal, and finally let both Mnesilochus and Euripides off on condition he reveals no more, the women thus humorously conceding what he'd said was true etc.

- in *parabasis* women turn tables and give examples of men who have harmed city (in line with normal conventions of Old Comedy) and beneficial women etc.
- in addition to above, stereotyping also major element in portrayal of Scythian etc.
- sufficient attention to some other sources of humour / techniques to present balanced argument.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(30 marks)

Option D

11 'A Roman wife's reputation depended entirely on her rearing of children and caring for family members.'

How far do you agree? Give the reasons for your views.

You might include discussion of

- **the nature of the evidence**
- **the Sabine women**
- **Lucretia**
- **Cornelia, mother of the Gracchi**
- **Turia**
- **Calpurnia, Pliny's wife**
- **Arria and her granddaughter Fannia.**

Judgements may be supported by discussion of a range (but **not** necessarily all) of **e.g.**

- Livy's *History* had moral purpose in line with Augustan values; Sabine women part of Rome's foundation myth enshrining some fundamental values / attitudes; emphasis on women's submission to husbands, in return for which would be treated with respect, and their child-bearing function; Valerius in speech in debate over Oppian Law repeal refers to Sabine women's later intervention in battle, praiseworthy because at a critical point it demonstrated they fully accepted their Roman-defined domestic role and were prepared to show initiative and courage in defending both it and the wider interests of Rome, and therefore a bench-mark against which later women's behaviour could be measured etc.
- Lucretia: wins contest because of her nocturnal domestic industry for material benefit of family; capitulates to Tarquinius only in order to avoid even greater dishonour which she will be unable to rectify, and commits suicide to become *exemplum* to future generations of women, at same time ensuring preservation of family honour and creation of Republic etc.
- Cornelia: statue records her maternal role – alleged to have called children her 'jewels' – but also remembered for her fortitude in grief, upholding family values, political insights in advising son, culture and education, rejection of marriage to Ptolemy etc.
- Turia: eulogy makes passing reference to domestic virtues characteristic of all women who value their good name, but these virtually taken for granted and far more emphasis on how she cared for both husband and other family members in exceptional circumstances with courage, independence, intelligence, self-sacrifice etc.; though

infertile, she fully realised importance of procreation and a child's upbringing, offering to find a new wife but committing herself to caring for the offspring etc.

- Calpurnia: Pliny's regret about miscarriage but optimism to her grandfather of future conception; much praised for devotion to Pliny, in particular her discreet support for his legal and literary activities etc.
- Arria: according to Pliny in letter in which Arria used to illustrate a general point about the way people are remembered, Arria showed extreme devotion to caring for family members in accordance with Stoic principles of family, concerned not only with their physical well-being but also with their honour, as shown by suicide to encourage and console husband Paetus, but most notable in actions when he seemed to be terminally ill and son died etc.
- Fannia too caught her seemingly fatal illness from her care of Vestal Junia (a relative), but care for husband and family honour led her to show courage, determination etc. accompanying husband into exile and standing trial for authorising his biography etc.

Apply Levels of Response at beginning of Mark Scheme.

(30 marks)

Assessment Objectives Grid
Unit 1D Women in Athens and Rome

Section 1

Either
Option A

	AO1	AO2	TOTAL
01	1	-	1
02	1	-	1
03	3	-	3
04	5	5	10
05	8	12	20
TOTAL	18	17	35

Or
Option B

	AO1	AO2	TOTAL
06	3	-	3
07	2	-	2
08	5	5	10
09	8	12	20
TOTAL	18	17	35

Section 2

Either
Option C

	AO1	AO2	TOTAL
10	12	18	30
TOTAL	12	18	30

Or
Option D

	AO1	AO2	TOTAL
11	12	18	30
TOTAL	12	18	30

OVERALL

	AO1	AO2	TOTAL
TOTAL	30	35	65
%	46%	54%	100%

UMS conversion calculator www.aqa.org.uk/umsconversion