
DIVINITY

9011/23

Paper 2 The Four Gospels

October/November 2016

MARK SCHEME

Maximum Mark: 100

Published

This mark scheme is published as an aid to teachers and candidates, to indicate the requirements of the examination. It shows the basis on which Examiners were instructed to award marks. It does not indicate the details of the discussions that took place at an Examiners' meeting before marking began, which would have considered the acceptability of alternative answers.

Mark schemes should be read in conjunction with the question paper and the Principal Examiner Report for Teachers.

Cambridge will not enter into discussions about these mark schemes.

Cambridge is publishing the mark schemes for the October/November 2016 series for most Cambridge IGCSE[®], Cambridge International A and AS Level components and some Cambridge O Level components.

Page 2	Mark Scheme	Syllabus	Paper
	Cambridge International A Level – October/November 2016	9011	23

Candidates are expected to show ‘ability to organise and present information, ideas, descriptions and arguments clearly and logically’ and to write their answers ‘in continuous prose’. A good essay answers the question holistically; the interpretation and comparison of issues will be demonstrated in the course of explanation and analysis of the relevant material, and thus evidence of the fulfilment of the assessment objectives will be inextricably interwoven. Marks are always awarded for the two assessment objectives which, when combined, produce a mark which is appropriate for the overall grade descriptions.

NB. Any response which is appropriate (i.e. a response to a reasonable interpretation of the question) is assessed according to the extent to which it meets the syllabus requirements and fulfils the objectives, conforming to the mark band descriptions.

The descriptions are cumulative, i.e. a description at one band builds on or improves the description at lower bands. Not *all* the qualities listed in a band may be demonstrated in an answer for it to fall within that band (some of the qualities are alternatives and therefore mutually exclusive).

ASSESSMENT OF OBJECTIVES

The examination will assess the candidate’s ability:

1 To demonstrate knowledge and understanding of the main approaches to the aspects of religion specified in their chosen area through the selection, explanation and interpretation of relevant material (60%).

- 0 none evident
- 1–2 very limited/serious inaccuracies and/or relevance/completely unacceptable quality of language
- 3–4 some significant omissions/some knowledge but no attempt at explanation of interpretation/very poor quality of language
- 5 knowledge and understanding partial and insufficient/any explanation attempted betrays poor understanding/interpretation incorrect/definite evidence of a serious error which outweighs otherwise acceptable demonstration of knowledge and understanding/poor quality of language
- 6 some irrelevance but sufficient material present/quality of explanation basic/interpretation limited but attempted/significant error(s) of fact but otherwise promising/quality of language fair
- 7–8 mostly accurate and relevant/evidence that knowledge and understanding are wider than merely basic/competent handling of material/reasonable quality of language
- 9–10 accurate, comprehensive, apposite, largely coherent/good quality of language
- 11–12 selection of material is wide and detailed and is restricted to the relevant/explanation shows full understanding/interpretative skills well evidenced/excellent quality of language
- 13–15 sophisticated in explanation and interpretation of scholarship; outstandingly mature in approach

Page 3	Mark Scheme	Syllabus	Paper
	Cambridge International A Level – October/November 2016	9011	23

2 To analyse and evaluate the issues that arise from a consideration of a mainstream academic study in their chosen area, using an appropriate quality of language (40%)

Evaluative ability will be assessed on the quality of the reasoning and evidence used to arrive at a position rather than the position itself. It is thus impracticable to include likely responses in this area in the outlines

- 0 none evident
- 1 only vestigial evidence/largely incoherent/completely unacceptable quality of language.
- 2 very little evidence/serious misapprehensions and inaccuracies/poorly structured/very poor quality of language
- 3 very limited and largely unsuccessful/analysis very restricted/judgement not supported by evidence/poor quality of language
- 4 attempted, but limited or only partially successful/a few glimpses of genuine ability/quality of language fair
- 5 some evidence of ability/reasonable attempt to analyse and evaluate/fairly well-structured/some skill at communication/reasonable quality of language
- 6 having identified them, analyses and evaluates the main relevant opinions competently/logically structured / good quality of language
- 7 some well-grounded insights and judgements/coherently and systematically constructed/excellent quality of language
- 8+ personal insights and independent thought/sophistication and elegance in expression, construction and quality of language

Page 4	Mark Scheme	Syllabus	Paper
	Cambridge International A Level – October/November 2016	9011	23

3 To organise and present information, ideas, descriptions and arguments clearly and logically, taking into account the use of grammar, punctuation and spelling.

In essay answers, the organisation and presentation is inherent in the quality of the coherence and progression of the exposition; grammar, punctuation and spelling make a slightly less direct contribution to it but must be taken into account.

The overall mark for a question (all are allotted 25 marks) reflects the descriptions below, which are cumulative, with due allowance being made for variation between the levels achieved in the two objectives, and reflecting their weightings:

- 0 answer absent/completely irrelevant
- 1 – 4 largely irrelevant/very short/in note form making very few significant points/completely unacceptable quality of language
- 5 – 7 unfinished and without much potential/high level of inaccuracy outweighing accurate material/high level of irrelevance but makes some creditable points/in note form which might have been developed into an acceptable essay of moderate quality/very poor quality of language
- 8 – 9 short/immature/limited knowledge/unable to create a coherent argument/poor quality of language
- 10–11 basic factual knowledge accurate and sufficient/largely relevant/analysis, critical ability, reasoning limited but occasionally attempted/has seen the main point of the question/a promising start but finished in note form/quality of language fair but limited
- 12–13 accurate factual knowledge slightly wider than just basic/in general sticks to the point/fairly complete coverage of the expected material/competent handling of main technical vocabulary/some evidence of reading/glimpses of analytical ability/fairly well-structured/moderate quality of language
- 14–15 good and accurate factual knowledge/coherently constructed/some telling points made/definite evidence of reading/displays analytical ability/includes all the expected main points/competent handling of technical vocabulary/shows some knowledge of critical scholarship/understands what the question is looking for/reasonable quality of language
- 16–17 evidence of wide reading/quotes scholars' views fairly accurately/addresses the substance of the question confidently/is familiar with different schools of religious thought/good quality of language
- 18–19 up-to-date, accurate and comprehensively demonstrated knowledge of reputable schools of scholarly and religious thought/coherently and systematically constructed/well-informed evaluative judgements/in complete control of the material/excellent quality of language
- 20+ can compare, contrast and evaluate the views of scholars and schools of religious thought/personal insights and independent thought evident/outstanding maturity of thought and approach [for an 18 year-old]/sophistication and elegance in expression, construction and quality of language

Page 5	Mark Scheme	Syllabus	Paper
	Cambridge International A Level – October/November 2016	9011	23

Question 1

Only the RSV text is used in the mark scheme.

The points given below are by no means exclusive and examiners will credit all valid responses to the question.

- (a) **They do all their deeds to be seen by men; for they make their phylacteries broad and their fringes long, and they love the place of honour at feasts and the best seats in the synagogues, and salutations in the market places, and being called rabbi by men. (Matthew 23:5–7)**

Context: Discourse against the Pharisees in the last section of the main part of the Gospel.

Points:

- only in Matthew, but links with 6:1ff
- who are they? – some discussion concerning the Pharisees – hypocrisy
- phylacteries and fringes? – significance hem being broad and long
- identification of phylacteries – two leather boxes worn around the head and the left forearm of a Jewish male in worship – containing Tefillin: scrolls of Torah passages taken from Exodus and Deuteronomy
- meaning and significance of ‘rabbi’ – ‘teacher’
- contrast with the message of Jesus about humility and service

- (b) **So when Pilate saw that he was gaining nothing, but rather that a riot was beginning, he took water and washed his hands before the crowd, saying, “I am innocent of this man’s blood: see to it yourselves.” (Matthew 27:24)**

Context: The trial of Jesus before Pilate who has seen his offer to release Jesus instead of Barabbas rejected by the crowd.

Points:

- only in Matthew.
- Comment on Pilate - he was known to be a weak ruler and went on to lose his position because of this weakness.
- comment on ‘saw that he gained nothing’
- It is very unlikely Pilate would have performed this action, thus we have to consider why Matthew included it – washing hands as a sign of innocence is a Jewish act rather than a Roman one.
- Could this be the foundation of the anti-Semitism?

- (c) **And he preached, saying, “After me comes he who is mightier than I, the thong of whose sandals I am not worthy to stoop down and untie. I have baptized you with water; but he will baptize you with the Holy Spirit.” (Mark 1:7–8)**

Context: From the description of John the Baptist and his ministry at the beginning of the gospel.

Points:

- Who is preaching? And who is coming after?
- Significance of what is said about someone coming after ... John the forerunner.

Page 6	Mark Scheme	Syllabus	Paper
	Cambridge International A Level – October/November 2016	9011	23

- Significance of ‘the thong of whose sandals ...’ showing the humility of John in the presence of the Messiah. Not worthy of the act of a servant in the presence of the Messiah.
- Discussion concerning baptism by water – baptism signifying washing away of sin. A new beginning. Cleansing from sin.
- Contrast with baptism with the Holy Spirit. What is meant by the latter?

(d) And he awoke and rebuked the wind, and said to the sea, “Peace! Be still!” And the wind ceased, and there was a great calm. (Mark 4:39)

Context: Storm on the lake, the evening after a day of preaching in parables.

Points:

- found also in Matthew and Luke
- The lake is not named in this passage but is often thought to be the Sea of Galilee.
- Comment on nature miracles in Mark specifically – the ‘divine’ side of Jesus – and generally in the Synoptics.
- Significance of what is said by Jesus here: power over wind and waves demonstrating the Creator’s power (cf Psalm 107:29).

(e) When the messengers of John had gone, he began to speak to the crowd concerning John: “What did you go out into the wilderness to behold? A reed shaken by the wind?” (Luke 7:24)

Context: Following the incident when some disciples of John had come to Jesus to ask who he was.

Points:

- Q material (also in Matthew)
- explain who John was and why he had sent messengers to Jesus
- Significance here of ‘the crowds’ and their possible reaction to what Jesus was saying.
- the meaning of Jesus’ statement
- the relationship between John and Jesus – never easy in Luke
- the “He” here is Jesus
- OT background to this quotation – the ‘reed’ being of significance

(f) Soon afterward he went on through cities and villages, preaching and bringing the good news of the kingdom of God. (Luke 8:1a)

Context: Galilean ministry, after the incident in the house of Simon the Pharisee: the anointing by and the forgiveness of the woman ‘who was a sinner’, Jesus has gone out through cities and villages preaching the good news of the kingdom.

Points:

- only in Luke.
- Comment upon Jesus’ mission to the ‘cities and villages’ – comparison with Luke 10.
- comment upon the good news of the kingdom
- Luke’s understanding of the ‘Kingdom’

Page 7	Mark Scheme	Syllabus	Paper
	Cambridge International A Level – October/November 2016	9011	23

- (g) Now there was a man of the Pharisees, named Nicodemus, a ruler of the Jews. This man came to Jesus by night and said to him... (John 3:1–2a)**

Context: Early in John's account of Jesus' ministry, just after the first Passover.

Points:

- only in John
- the first discourse
- Who is 'this man'? What is the significance of him being a Pharisee?
- Why did he come by night?
- What does it mean 'ruler of the Jews'?

- (h) Since it was the day of Preparation, in order to prevent the bodies from remaining on the cross on the sabbath (for that sabbath was a high day), the Jews asked Pilate that their legs might be broken, and that they might be taken away. (John 19:31)**

Context: The crucifixion, just after Jesus had uttered his last words.

Points:

- only in John.
- The 'day of Preparation'... for the Passover, which opens up a significant discussion about the timing of the crucifixion in John.
- Pilate: who was he and what was his part in John's account?
- Why should bodies not be on the cross on the Sabbath? The Sabbath laws prevented dead bodies being touched on the Sabbath – they were deemed unclean.
- significance of the breaking of the legs

Page 8	Mark Scheme	Syllabus	Paper
	Cambridge International A Level – October/November 2016	9011	23

Essays: each is marked out of 25. Essays must deal with the question asked and some of the points outlined below may be expected but they are not definitive or exclusive.

Essay Questions on specific gospels.

2 How important are forgiveness and compassion in Matthew's Gospel?

Here the question is looking at forgiveness and compassion. How is Jesus' teaching displayed in his actions? Examples of both of these acts are necessary for a rounded and full answer to this question. The two concepts are drawn together in Matthew's account of the Sermon on the Mount therefore there should be material from this in the candidate's answers. The other sources of material are the parables of Jesus and some material from the miracles of Jesus. Candidates need to demonstrate that they have considered both of these characteristics and not just one or the other. Essays should demonstrate a balance in the way they have constructed their answer.

3 How significant is the use of prophecy in Matthew's Gospel?

In Matthew's Gospel Jesus' life is shown as the fulfilment of the Law and the Old Testament prophets. This question will look into the Jewishness of this Gospel. Matthew makes the greatest use of prophecy. A total of 14 items are quoted by Matthew, most introduced with a statement to the effect that: "... all this took place to fulfill ..."

Isaiah is most widely cited by Matthew. There also are references to Samuel, Psalms, Jeremiah, Hosea, Micah and Zechariah.

Matthew's drive to demonstrate that Jesus' life is a fulfilment of prophecy can lead to a particular interpretation of the Old Testament scriptures – beginning with the virgin birth of Jesus: "Look, the virgin shall conceive and bear a son, and they shall name him Emmanuel." (Matthew 1:23, from Isaiah 7:14).

This question asks for the candidate to make an assessment of the significance of prophecy and some attempt to address this is necessary for high marks. There is plenty of material to draw from.

Some candidates may make mention of the figures of Moses and Elijah's appearances at the Transfiguration as part of their answer. Comment should be included about the purpose of Matthew in writing his Gospel. A clear attempt to address the question in full is needed.

4 Assess the view that the death of Jesus is the most important event recorded in Mark's Gospel.

Mark's gospel is often seen as the gospel of the Passion because of the sheer volume of the work given over to the death of Jesus. The whole point of Jesus' Messianic identity being kept secret in Mark's Gospel is that he had to die. Even when the disciples confess that he's the Messiah and they come to understand him as this, they don't really realize that he must die as part of his Messianic identity. The emphasis on Jesus' time has come or his time is not yet here is evidence that the Gospel is given over to this event.

There is a lot of material that is available to answer this question – the timing of his life and death, the Messianic Secret, the events of the last week and the fulfilment of Jesus' work on earth. Mark's gospel is the first one that really tells us the Passion Narrative in as much detail. The way Mark tells the story of the death of Jesus is to see him as a lonely figure who goes to his death abandoned by all of his followers and supporters and even abandoned by his God. Jesus from

Page 9	Mark Scheme	Syllabus	Paper
	Cambridge International A Level – October/November 2016	9011	23

the cross says, "My God, my God, why have you forsaken me?" His death is seen as the fulfilment of his life's mission.

Candidates should find this an interesting choice of question but answers should include an element of assessment of this matter therefore they need to show that it is possible to view other events as important also: Jesus' ministry and teaching, his miracles and his parables have a distinct and important contribution to make, but are they as important as the death to the writer of Mark?

5 Examine Jesus' teaching about the kingdom of God in Mark's Gospel.

Answers should reflect the two main views of the Kingdom (i) the present reality (Jesus healing the sick, attested at the baptism and the transfiguration, the words of the centurion at the cross, some of the 'son of man' sayings, etc); (ii) the future coming (passages such as Mark 13). The kingdom of God parables of Chapter 4 are an important area of discussion.

The Kingdom is not a place, or a group of people, but denotes the power and the rule of God. This Kingdom will involve a battle between the powers of evil and the power of God. We see this both in the healing of the sick (especially the casting out of demons) and in the Markan Apocalypse (Mark 13).

6 'The songs of Mary, Zechariah and Simeon all set the scene for what is to follow later in Luke's Gospel.' Discuss.

Candidates should attempt to develop some of the main Lukan themes in their discussions. Magnificat (Mary): extolling the poor at the expense of the rich and powerful, the choice and status of Mary. Benedictus (Zechariah): Davidic messiah defeating enemies, bringing light to the world. Nunc Dimittis (Simeon): salvation of the people (Jews) and the light to the Gentiles.

Themes include: the poor, the rich, women, joy, universalism and salvation.

Candidates may demonstrate that these songs show the strong initial connection with the Jewish world from which the Gentile mission begins.

7 Examine Luke's account of the resurrection and of the post-resurrection appearances of Jesus.

There is plenty material in the last section of the Gospel (Luke 24) and candidates are likely to focus their discussion upon the theologically rich 'Emmaus' story (Luke's own material) and the fulfilment of scripture.

The two men did not recognise Jesus as the one who walked with them. In addition there is the resurrection itself (the question is not just asking for 'L' material).

All the accounts of the resurrection appearances are a surprise to the disciples involved which indicates their lack of understanding and faith.

Jesus' appearances to the disciples in Jerusalem with him eating fish; his teaching to them concerning the scriptures, and finally the ascension.

Page 10	Mark Scheme	Syllabus	Paper
	Cambridge International A Level – October/November 2016	9011	23

8 Show why the resurrection of Lazarus is seen as central to the Gospel of John.

This presupposes an awareness of the 'I am' sayings and the 'signs' in John's gospel.

There will be some retelling of the story to set this in context but in order to gain the higher marks there needs to be an understanding of the wider significance of this event in the life of Jesus in preparation for his own resurrection.

Following this miracle the Pharisees speed up their action against Jesus and so this is the final incident after which the Gospel heads towards his Passion and final days.

The candidate is invited to make an assessment as to the centrality of this miracle and therefore there is a need to analyse the significance in the light of the events which followed;

- the Pharisees called a meeting of the Sanhedrin and the plot to kill Jesus followed
- Jesus was no longer able to move around publically but withdrew to a quiet place
- this was just prior to the beginning of the last week of Jesus' life.

9 Discuss the importance of the following 'I am' sayings in John's Gospel.

- (i) the Good Shepherd**
- (ii) the resurrection and the life**
- (iii) the way, the truth and the life.**

The 'I am' sayings are central to the Johannine christology. This discussion should allow candidates to show a good general knowledge of the christological points that arise and a specific knowledge of these 'I am' sayings. The term 'I am' is used 27 times in the gospel and answers could make reference to many but should have a knowledge of the 3 specific sayings. Examiners should expect a detailed discussion of each. The essays should present specific points being brought out by way of example and illustration. These 'I am' sayings are found in

- 10:11, The Good Shepherd

In this passage, Jesus contrasts the shepherd with the hired hand who runs away while the shepherd lays down his life for the sheep. What are other differences? How can we recognise the hired hand?

Jesus also compares his knowledge of the sheep and theirs of him with the knowledge the Father and the Son have for each other. How do we as sheep know our shepherd? What does it say about our knowledge of him and our relationship to him to make this comparison with the Trinity? Who are the other sheep, not of this fold? How does he bring them in?

- 11:25, The resurrection and the life

Here Jesus proclaims himself to be our way to his destination, to his Father's house. What does it mean for him to be a way (the context shows Jesus means a path or a route here)? And he proclaims that he is Life itself when resurrecting a dead friend.

Page 11	Mark Scheme	Syllabus	Paper
	Cambridge International A Level – October/November 2016	9011	23

Essay questions on general gospel themes

10 Explain and analyse the teaching of Jesus on discipleship and commitment.

There is a lot of material in the Synoptics (especially Luke) which candidates can draw from – discussions with Nicodemus and the Samaritan woman. The scope for this question is quite large. Candidates who write about just the disciples themselves, rather than discipleship will not answer the question asked. Discipleship may include:

- the cost of discipleship
- possessions and discipleship
- mission and discipleship
- disciples called to leave all.

The relationship between discipleship and commitment.

11 Examine solutions to the Synoptic Problem.

The emphasis is first on setting out their understanding of what the problem is before discussing the various scholarly solutions put forward.

Diagrams can be used but for higher marks they should be accompanied by a written explanation. A lot of candidates will refer to dated scholarly evidence from Streeter and Wrede.

Main points:

- priority of Mark
- Luke's own material 'L'
- Matthew's own material 'M'
- Quelle (Q) source
- Two source hypothesis
- Four source hypothesis

12 Discuss Jesus' teaching on wealth and material possessions.

There is ample material to draw on but to gain higher marks there must be an attempt to show that they know that the different gospel writers approach this topic in a way that reflects their individual themes and particular interests. There is a lot of material to be found in Luke as a more 'social' gospel and Matthew with its flavour of Judaism.

Some materials available for comment –:

- the rich (ruler) man who comes to Jesus
- the parable of Lazarus and the rich man
- the temple tax
- the cost of discipleship – leaving all to follow Jesus
- the widow's coins
- the woman and the expensive perfume.

Page 12	Mark Scheme	Syllabus	Paper
	Cambridge International A Level – October/November 2016	9011	23

13 Explain the difficulties of interpreting the ethical teachings of Jesus.

Candidates should draw on the Sermons on the Mount and the Plain for a lot of the relevant material. For high marks candidates ought to be selective and make a genuine attempt to highlight some of the difficulties. This is a huge topic therefore there is no expected standard response to this question. Whilst candidates are free to develop arguments as they choose, these arguments must be scholarly and supported by textual examples.

The following might be mentioned such as the main areas of ethical discussion including non-violence, non-retaliation, renunciation of possessions, wealth, family, divorce, lust, altruism – ‘good Samaritan’ and humility.

Relevant parables such as the Rich man and Lazarus, the Good Samaritan, the labourers in the vineyard, the unmerciful servant should be referred to by candidates.

Candidates may also raise questions: Did Jesus intend his teaching to be followed by everyone? Are there any common, general themes? Is Jesus acting like an Old Testament prophet?

Whilst problems will include looking at the relationship between Christ’s teaching and the Jewish Law.

14 Assess the similarities and differences between the Gospel accounts of Jesus’ trial before Pilate.

To access the high mark bands candidates should make a genuine attempt to note the areas of similarities and comment upon the significance of the differences.

They may comment upon the way Pilate is represented in the accounts.

Key points might include:

- the differences between the accounts
- the relationship between Pilate and the Jewish authorities
- Pilate’s own character: is his washing of hands in Matthew really likely?
- the inclusion of the trial before Herod in Luke
- specific points can be made on the Johannine account.