

MARK SCHEME for the October/November 2014 series

9011 DIVINITY

9011/23

Paper 2 (The Four Gospels), maximum raw mark 100

This mark scheme is published as an aid to teachers and candidates, to indicate the requirements of the examination. It shows the basis on which Examiners were instructed to award marks. It does not indicate the details of the discussions that took place at an Examiners' meeting before marking began, which would have considered the acceptability of alternative answers.

Mark schemes should be read in conjunction with the question paper and the Principal Examiner Report for Teachers.

Cambridge will not enter into discussions about these mark schemes.

Cambridge is publishing the mark schemes for the October/November 2014 series for most Cambridge IGCSE[®], Cambridge International A and AS Level components and some Cambridge O Level components.

Page 2	Mark Scheme	Syllabus	Paper
	Cambridge International A Level – October/November 2014	9011	23

Candidates are expected to show ‘ability to organise and present information, ideas, descriptions and arguments clearly and logically’ and to write their answers ‘in continuous prose’. A good essay answers the question holistically; the interpretation and comparison of issues will be demonstrated in the course of explanation and analysis of the relevant material, and thus evidence of the fulfilment of the assessment objectives will be inextricably interwoven. Marks are always awarded for the two assessment objectives which, when combined, produce a mark which is appropriate for the overall grade descriptions.

NB. Any response which is appropriate (i.e. a response to a reasonable interpretation of the question) is assessed according to the extent to which it meets the syllabus requirements and fulfils the objectives, conforming to the mark band descriptions.

The Examiner’s task is to assess the ability of each answer according to the descriptions provided. The marks are an intermediate stage on the route to assessment of attainment, which is ultimately reported as a grade. The mark for an answer is a true reflection of the candidate’s level of attainment in the assessment objectives for the syllabus according to their weightings, bearing in mind the Syllabus Aims and what may reasonably be expected of an 18-year-old who has studied the syllabus for two years.

The descriptions are cumulative, i.e. a description at one band builds on or improves the description at lower bands. Not *all* the qualities listed in a band may be demonstrated in an answer for it to fall within that band (some of the qualities are alternatives and therefore mutually exclusive).

Page 3	Mark Scheme	Syllabus	Paper
	Cambridge International A Level – October/November 2014	9011	23

ASSESSMENT OF OBJECTIVES

The examination will assess the candidate's ability:

- To demonstrate knowledge and understanding of the main approaches to the aspects of religion specified in their chosen area through the selection, explanation and interpretation of relevant material (60%).**

0	none evident
1–2	very limited / serious inaccuracies and / or relevance / completely unacceptable quality of language.
3–4	some significant omissions / some knowledge but no attempt at explanation of interpretation / very poor quality of language.
5	knowledge and understanding partial and insufficient / any explanation attempted betrays poor understanding / interpretation incorrect / definite evidence of a serious error which outweighs otherwise acceptable demonstration of knowledge and understanding / poor quality of language.
6	[E] (minimum acceptable for A level pass) some irrelevance but sufficient material present / quality of explanation basic / interpretation limited but attempted / significant error(s) of fact but otherwise promising / quality of language fair.
7–8	mostly accurate and relevant / evidence that knowledge and understanding are wider than merely basic / competent handling of material / reasonable quality of language.
9–10	accurate, comprehensive, apposite, largely coherent / good quality of language.
11–12	[A] selection of material is wide and detailed and is restricted to the relevant / explanation shows full understanding / interpretative skills well evidenced / excellent quality of language.
13–15	sophisticated in explanation and interpretation of scholarship; outstandingly mature in approach.

[NB 'relevant material' includes both objective evidence (usually original texts / writings by protagonists / contemporary observers, but could include archaeology, tradition etc.) and 'recent [19th & 20th C] mainstream academic study' (see NB to AO2).]

Page 4	Mark Scheme	Syllabus	Paper
	Cambridge International A Level – October/November 2014	9011	23

2. To analyse and evaluate the issues that arise from a consideration of a mainstream academic study in their chosen area, using an appropriate quality of language (40%).

Evaluative ability will be assessed on the quality of the reasoning and evidence used to arrive at a position rather than the position itself. It is thus impracticable to include likely responses in this area in the outlines

- 0 none evident
- 1 only vestigial evidence / largely incoherent / completely unacceptable quality of language.
- 2 very little evidence / serious misapprehensions and inaccuracies / poorly structured / very poor quality of language.
- 3 very limited and largely unsuccessful / analysis very restricted / judgement not supported by evidence / poor quality of language.
- 4 [E] (minimum accepts quality for A level pass) attempted, but limited or only partially successful / a few glimpses of genuine ability / quality of language fair.
- 5 some evidence of ability / reasonable attempt to analyse and evaluate / fairly well-structured / some skill at communication / reasonable quality of language.
- 6 having identified them, analyses and evaluates the main relevant opinions competently / logically structured / good quality of language.
- 7 [A] some well-grounded insights and judgements / coherently and systematically constructed / excellent quality of language
- 8+ personal insights and independent thought / sophistication and elegance in expression, construction and quality of language.

[NB 'mainstream academic study' is intended to exclude GCSE level textbooks and material that is not widely accepted in the academic community (e.g. *The Holy Blood and The Holy Grail*; anything to do with the Egyptian pyramids, Stonehenge, astrology etc. in a pseudo religion context; material such as *The Protocols of the Elders of Zion*, *The Satanic Verses* etc. which is offensive and / or libellous).]

Page 5	Mark Scheme	Syllabus	Paper
	Cambridge International A Level – October/November 2014	9011	23

3. To organise and present information, ideas, descriptions and arguments clearly and logically, taking into account the use of grammar, punctuation and spelling.

In essay answers, the organisation and presentation is inherent in the quality of the coherence and progression of the exposition; grammar, punctuation and spelling make a slightly less direct contribution to it but must be taken into account. Overall adjustment to the final mark for an essay [out of 25] is unlikely to be more than one mark in either direction, and is best carried out as part of the final judgement according to the overall descriptions. Examiners should refer to the Level exemplars of quality of language for SCAA.

The overall mark for a question (all are allotted 25 marks) reflects the descriptions below, which are cumulative, with due allowance being made for variation between the levels achieved in the two objectives, and reflecting their weightings:

- 0** Answer absent / gibberish / completely irrelevant.
- 1 – 4** Largely irrelevant / very short / in note form making very few significant points / completely unacceptable quality of language.
- 5 – 7** Unfinished and without much potential / high level of inaccuracy outweighing accurate material / high level of irrelevance but makes some creditable points / in note form which might have been developed into an acceptable essay of moderate quality / very poor quality of language.
- 8 – 9** Does not quite meet the standard required for an A level pass / too short / immature / limited knowledge / unable to create a coherent argument / poor quality of language.
- 10 – 11** **Grade E** / minimum acceptable quality for A level pass / basic factual knowledge accurate and sufficient / largely relevant / analysis, critical ability, reasoning limited but occasionally attempted / has seen the main point of the question / a promising start but finished in note form / quality of language fair but limited.
- 12 – 13** Accurate factual knowledge slightly wider than just basic / in general sticks to the point / fairly complete coverage of the expected material / competent handling of main technical vocabulary / some evidence of reading / glimpses of analytical ability / fairly well-structured / moderate quality of language.
- 14 – 15** Good and accurate factual knowledge / coherently constructed / some telling points made / definite evidence of reading / displays analytical ability / includes all the expected main points / competent handling of technical vocabulary / shows some knowledge of critical scholarship / understands what the question is looking for / reasonable quality of language.
- 16 – 17** **Grade B** / evidence of wide reading / quotes scholars' views fairly accurately / addresses the substance of the question confidently / is familiar with different schools of religious thought / good quality of language.
- 18 – 19** **Grade A** / up-to-date, accurate and comprehensively demonstrated knowledge of reputable schools of scholarly and religious thought / coherently and systematically constructed / well-informed evaluative judgements / in complete control of the material / excellent quality of language.
- 20+** Grade A(1) / can compare, contrast and evaluate the views of scholars and schools of religious thought / personal insights and independent thought evident / outstanding maturity of thought and approach [for an 18-year-old] / sophistication and elegance in expression, construction and quality of language.

Page 6	Mark Scheme	Syllabus	Paper
	Cambridge International A Level – October/November 2014	9011	23

Question 1 Gobbets

(a) The book of the genealogy of Jesus Christ, the Son of David, the Son of Abraham (Matthew 1:1)

Context: Matthean opening – the beginning of the genealogy.

Points:

- Only Matthew starts like this.
- Brief comparison with Luke can be credited.
- Purpose of genealogy, especially for Matthew, but this shouldn't be an essay on Matthew's genealogy.
- Comment on 'Jesus Christ'.
- Comment on 'the Son of David'.
- Comment on 'the son of Abraham'.

(b) So when Pilate saw that he was gaining nothing, but rather that a riot was beginning, he took water and washed his hands before the crowd, saying "I am innocent of this man's blood, see to it yourselves." (Matthew 27:24)

Context: trial before Pilate, after the chief priests and elders had asked for the release of Barabbas and the crucifixion of Jesus.

Points:

- Washing of hands only in Matthew.
- Pilate's predicament can be discussed.
- 'a riot was beginning' explains why.
- The significance of Pilate's declaration is worth discussion and can widen to consider the gospel writers portrayal of Pilate generally (up to two marks).

(c) And when he came up out of the water, immediately he saw the heavens opened and the Spirit descending upon him like a dove: and a voice came from heaven "Thou art my beloved Son; with thee I am well pleased." (Mark 1:10-11)

Context: baptism of Jesus by John in the River Jordan.

Points:

- Gospel opens with John – no birth narratives.
- The significance of water baptisms, at that time (and later).
- Comment on the 'spirit descending upon him like a dove' – plenty of OT imagery and significance.
- Significance of the 'voice came from heaven'.
- 'Thou art my beloved Son; with thee I am well pleased'- self-identification, calling, etc. Significance of this for Mark. Why 'son'?
- Overall comment on the importance of this event for the whole gospel story is creditable.

Page 7	Mark Scheme	Syllabus	Paper
	Cambridge International A Level – October/November 2014	9011	23

- (d) **And they went out and fled from the tomb; for trembling and astonishment had come upon them; and they said nothing to any one, for they were afraid. (Mark 16:8)**

Context: the resurrection of Jesus in Mark – the women at the tomb being greeted by the ‘young man in white’.

Points:

- The most probable ending of Mark’s gospel.
- ‘they’... identity and purpose of the women can be discussed.
- Significance of ‘trembling and astonishment...’ and, ‘for they were afraid...’
- Significance of ‘say nothing to anyone’.

- (e) **...and also some women who had been healed of evil spirits and infirmities: Mary, called Magdalene, from whom seven demons had gone out, and Joanna the wife of Chuza, Herod’s steward, and Susanna, and many others, who provided for them out of their means. (Luke 8:2-3)**

Context : After the visit to Simon the Pharisee’s house, just before the Parable of the Sower.

Points:

- Only in Luke.
- Luke’s concern for ‘women’, though this should not become an essay in itself.
- Comment on the meaning and significance of ‘had been healed of evil spirits and infirmities’.
- Some comments as to the possible identity of the women...
- ...plus a comment on the significance of ‘who provided for them out of their means’, a very unusual statement.

- (f) **The seventy returned with joy, saying, “Lord, even the demons are subject to us in your name!” (Luke 10:17)**

Context: the seventy (seventy-two) had been sent out with the instructions from Jesus and had now returned... Jesus responds with “I saw Satan fall like lightning from heaven”.

Points:

- Only in Luke.
- Seventy or seventy-two: worth mentioning for 1 mark.
- The theme of ‘joy’ in Luke.
- The main notion of demons being subject to Jesus is an important area to discuss: e.g. the victory over Satan. There is also the whole concept of a Satan-free ministry which is emphasised by a number of scholars. Satan returns (22:3) when he enters into Judas.
- The Christian mission generally could be worth a comment.

Page 8	Mark Scheme	Syllabus	Paper
	Cambridge International A Level – October/November 2014	9011	23

- (g) **“As long as I am in the world, I am the light of the world.” As he said this, he spat on the ground and made clay of the spittle and anointed the man's eyes with the clay... (John 9:5-6)**

Context: This comes during the healing of the blind man in answer to the question posed by the disciples as to whose fault is it that the man is blind.

Points:

- Comment upon the light and darkness theme in John.
- Links with the Prologue of the gospel.
- The position of this ‘I am’ saying – it comes in the middle of the healing of the man born blind.
- The relationship between signs and ‘I am’ sayings in the gospel.
- The purpose of the ‘I am’ sayings and the signs.

- (h) **When Jesus has spoken these words, he lifted up his eyes to heaven and said, “Father, the hour has come; glorify thy Son and the Son may glorify thee”. (John 17:1)**

Context: Jesus’ ‘farewell’ prayer is the context of Jesus teaching his disciples about his departure and just prior to the betrayal.

Points:

- Only in John.
- Comment on ‘lifted up his eyes to heaven’, a similar action for prayer is recorded in 11:41 – possible comparisons with the synoptic theophanies of the baptism and the transfiguration.
- Comment on ‘the hour has come’, especially in the Johannine context and use (12:23, 13:1).
- Comment on ‘glorify the Son’ – the process of glorification had already begun with the announcement of the ‘hour’, but it is not yet complete (see 13:31-32).
- General comment on the Father / Son relationship in John.

Page 9	Mark Scheme	Syllabus	Paper
	Cambridge International A Level – October/November 2014	9011	23

Essay questions on specific gospels.

2 Examine the importance of the end of the world in the parables of Jesus in Matthew's gospel.

Plenty of scope here for the candidate to show a good knowledge of the Matthean text. We are here looking for two types of material:

1. Those parables which Matthew has taken over from Mark (has 'changed' them?);
2. Those parables which are only found in Matthew.

The latter includes: the parables relevant to the question are those found in 13:44, the Treasure; 13:45f, the Pearl; 13:47f, the Drag Net; 18:23-25, the Unmerciful Servant; 20:1-16, the Labourers in the Vineyard; 21:28-32, the Two Sons; 22:11-14, the Guest Without the Wedding Garment (appendix to The Great Supper shared with Luke); 25:1-13, The Ten Virgins; 25:14-30, the Last Judgement. There should be genuine attempt to discuss how importantly Matthew views the end of the world in the light of his choice of parables.

3 How far does Matthew show Peter as the leader of the disciples?

There is plenty of material to construct an effective essay which could make a number of different points about the role of Peter in the Gospel story. The best essays will, however, make a point emphasising and developing the specific Matthean emphasis of Matthew 16. There should also be an attempt to evaluate the importance of Peter's role. Main references to Peter in the gospel are:

- 4:17-19 calling;
- 14:28-33 walking on water;
- 15:5 'explain the parable to us...';
- 16:17 Confession and Transfiguration;
- 18:21 'how many times should I forgive my brother...?'
- 19:27 'we have left everything to follow you....';
- 26 and lots of references during the build-up to the Passion.

4 Discuss the idea of the Messianic secret in Mark's gospel.

The best essays will be based around Wrede's theory and candidates should certainly be familiar with the traditional texts and arguments (e.g. the rebuking of the demons, the silencing of the reporting of miracles, Jesus retiring from public view, etc.), but the question is asking for much more than a 'list' and brief discussion of points. Good answers will attempt some comment on whether Mark has gone out of his way to do this (hence purposely) in order to illustrate his point (i.e. imposed this idea upon his material for apologetic purposes) or whether this is a mistake on behalf of the reader.

There is definitely a command to silence in Mark, but is it with regard to Messiahship? It is likely that it is 'false impressions' that Mark's Jesus wanted to prevent. Textual examples should be used in all types of answer, e.g. Peter's confession (8:27-33), the Entry into Jerusalem (11:1-11), the Trial (14:61f), the use of the term 'Son of man' etc.

Page 10	Mark Scheme	Syllabus	Paper
	Cambridge International A Level – October/November 2014	9011	23

5 How much do we really know about when and where Mark wrote his gospel?

The candidates can draw upon a range of relevant material. The best essays will be selective in their use and assessment of the examples chosen. Most will write about the suffering motive within the gospel, making connections with the persecuted Christian community at Rome in AD 64 / 65. In addition, use could be made of a good number of the following points:

- Papias and early Church tradition, which associates Mark with Rome (and with Peter).
- The existence of numerous 'Latinisms' in the text.
- The argument that Mark's gospel would only have been recognised if it had the weight of an important congregation behind it.
- The dating prior to the other synoptics, and to John (traditional arguments) but not too early because of the development of tradition.
- Most scholars date Mark between 64 and 70 AD.
- The Antioch questions?
- The presence of Mark 13 and the approaching Jewish war but no clear reference to the destruction of Jerusalem (70-71).

6 How distinctive is Luke's teaching about discipleship?

Candidates may have a good knowledge of a lot of the relevant material. Top candidates should be able to offer critical comment with possible observations as to practicality – is this an impossible ideal, an 'interim ethic', hyperbole, or the true requirements of the Christian life? Does Luke go 'over the top'?

Important passages are:

- The call of the first disciples (5), the missions of the twelve and the 72 (9 and 10), the cost of discipleship (9 and 14), the Parable of the Rich Fool (12), true riches and treasure in heaven (12), the rich ruler (18), the parable of the Rich man and Lazarus, Levi (5), Zacchaeus (19).
- Some relevant material can also be drawn from the Sermon on the Plain (6) and the various exhortations to humility that exist in the Gospel.

7 Examine why Luke wrote his gospel.

There may be a temptation for candidates to write in detail about the main Lukan themes. This is acceptable to an extent but it is hoped that good essays will make a genuine attempt to consider this question (why?) specifically (and possibly include reference to the book of Acts in the discussion), or at least to explain the main themes in light of the question asked.

- The dedication to Theophilus should certainly form a main part of the discussion (1:1-3)... to write 'the truth'.
- Possibly Luke is writing to defend Christianity to Rome.
- To explain the role played by the Jews.
- The Gentile question in the Early Church...leading to Luke's universalism (examples should relate to the question).

Page 11	Mark Scheme	Syllabus	Paper
	Cambridge International A Level – October/November 2014	9011	23

8 Critically assess the role of the ‘I am’ sayings in John’s gospel.

This essay should be fairly attractive to candidates who have studied John in any detail – the ‘I am’ sayings being central to the Johannine Christology. This discussion should show a good general knowledge of Johannine Christology and a specific knowledge of the ‘I am’ sayings in particular. The question demands more of an overview with specific points being brought out by way of example and illustration, especially with regard to chapter 6. Answers that are largely lists of points will not achieve the higher levels. Some attempt to make an assessment of the sayings is important for a good level.

- Although the term ‘I am’ is used some 27 times in the gospel, the candidates will be expected to refer to at least some of the seven passages which contain extended discussion. (Please note that it is not necessary to refer to all of them for a good level, just a selection.)
- The OT background is important and can be illustrated from the text.
- Each of the ‘seven’ gives rise to plenty of discussion so examiners should not expect a detailed discussion of each but an assessment of their significance.

9 ‘The themes of the first chapter of John do not appear again in the gospel.’ Discuss.

Although the Prologue seems to stand alone, dealing with the question of pre-existence, it is closely connected to the rest of the first chapter and then to the wider Gospel. The leading points of 1:1-18 are developed further in the chapter (1:19-51) and then in the rest of the entire work. This question is, however, not just limited to the Prologue but to all verses 1-51. The first chapter has been described as a ‘microcosm of the Gospel as a whole’, summarising the entire sweep of salvation history with which it is concerned (e.g. Smalley). The whole of the chapter is clearly an introduction of the rest:

- ‘Light and life’ (1:4f; 1:19-51; 8 and 9).
- Glory (1:14; 1:51; 2:11).
- The titles for Jesus – six appear in John 1 and each forms the starting point of a theological theme developed later in the Gospel.
- Names of people and places – all which reappear later...

Page 12	Mark Scheme	Syllabus	Paper
	Cambridge International A Level – October/November 2014	9011	23

10 Compare the gospel accounts of the events of Jesus' last week leading up to his crucifixion.

These accounts can be commented on as they are looked at by each gospel writer but there must be some evidence to show that the candidate is looking and commenting upon the things that are similar and the things which are different. A good textual knowledge is essential but the stories should not be retold without relevant comment and a clear attempt at addressing the question. Narrative alone cannot pass.

Among the events that should be looked at are:

- Judas' betrayal.
- The last supper.
- The arrest and trials.
- Peter's denial of Jesus.
- The decision made by the Jews to ask for the release of Barabbas.
- The role of Pilate in the various gospels.

The differences should look at material peculiar to different gospel writers.

There is a lot of information which may be included but not all events are necessary for a good level. Quality of comment is more important than quantity of material.

11 'The kingdom of God is presented in the gospels as both a present and a future event.' Discuss.

There is room for a lot of reference from the parables and to the well-known kingdom of God sayings. It is hoped that candidates will be aware of the eschatological problem in the gospels, showing an understanding of the difficulties in interpreting some of the material. Most references will be to the Synoptics but there is room for Johannine material, especially in relation to realised eschatology. The revelation of Jesus' kingship before Pilate ('not of this world') is interesting in the ensuing discussion. Pilate completely misunderstands the nature of Jesus' kingdom.

12 Assess the role of women in the gospels.

Many will relate examples of stories about women in the gospels, but there should be a genuine attempt to **discuss and assess the importance** to score well. There are many examples which can be used and candidates can come to their own conclusions:

- The part played by the two Marys: his mother and Magdalene.
- The prostitute (Luke 7:36–50).
- The woman with the flow of blood (Mark 5:25-34).
- The woman with the Spirit of infirmity (Luke 13:10-17).
- The healing of the Syro-Phoenician woman's daughter (Matthew 15:21-28).
- Mary and Martha (Luke 10:38-42).
- The Widow of Nain (Luke 7:11-17).
- The cure of Mary Magdalene (Luke 8:2) and the women who provided for Jesus (Luke 8:1-3).
- The Samaritan woman (John 4:7-42).
- The lament.

Page 13	Mark Scheme	Syllabus	Paper
	Cambridge International A Level – October/November 2014	9011	23

13 'We cannot decide which was the first gospel to be written.' How far do you agree with this statement?

This question will probably evince a large number of carefully-prepared 'priority of Mark' essays. However, it is hoped that a genuine attempt will be made to look at why the other gospels are not good candidates for being the first. This essay should not simply be a list of pro-Markan arguments, but there should be a convincing attempt to discuss them.

14 Evaluate the claim that the gospels are theology rather than history.

This is a broad question which allows candidates to use relevant material which they know. Do not expect a complete coverage of these points, but answers might include some of the following. Good answers will deal with what is meant by both history and theology, making the point that the two were not seen as separate in the first century AD. History, as we understand it, did not really exist (cf. Luke's dedication to Theophilus). The better answers will be supported by examples from the text.

- A gospel is not a biography and it is not specifically history – Luke's conception of the truth in Luke 1:1-3 is theological rather than factual. (The historicity question can certainly be raised and discussed.)
- A gospel is 'good news' – of the birth, life, death and resurrection of Christ (the Son of God) – an explanation of what the gospels are trying to do both seen individually and seen together.
- Statements of faith, of Christology and Theology rather than neutrality.
- Reflecting the purpose and situations of their authors.
- Similarities and differences between the gospels.