



ADVANCED SUBSIDIARY GCE CRITICAL THINKING

Unit 2: Assessing and Developing Argument

F492/01
F492/02

Candidates answer on the question paper

OCR Supplied Materials:

- Answer sheet for Section A Multiple Choice
- Resource Booklet

Other Materials Required:

None

Monday 12 January 2009
Afternoon

Duration: 1 hour 45 minutes



Candidate Forename		Candidate Surname	
-----------------------	--	----------------------	--

Centre Number						Candidate Number				
---------------	--	--	--	--	--	------------------	--	--	--	--

INSTRUCTIONS TO CANDIDATES

- Write your name clearly in capital letters, your Centre Number and Candidate Number in the boxes above.
- Use black ink. Pencil may be used for graphs and diagrams only.
- Read the Resource Booklet and each question carefully and make sure that you know what you have to do before starting your answer.
- Answer Section A, questions 1–20, on the answer sheet provided in pencil. You are advised to spend not more than 40 minutes on Section A.
- Answer Sections B and C in the spaces on the question paper in black ink.
- Do **not** write in the bar codes.
- Write your answer to each question in the space provided, however additional paper may be used if necessary.

INFORMATION FOR CANDIDATES

- The number of marks is given in brackets [] at the end of each question or part question.
- The total number of marks for this paper is **120**. Section A comprises 33% of the available marks; Sections B and C comprise 67% of the available marks.
- Up to 5 marks are available for quality of written communication in Sections B and C.
- This document consists of **20** pages. Any blank pages are indicated.

Examiner's Use Only:		
Section B /50		
Section C /25		
QWC/5		
Total		

Section A: Multiple Choice

Answer **all** questions in this section of this paper.

You are advised to spend no more than 40 minutes on this section of the paper.

- 1 New research shows that long-term exposure to noise pollution could be causing thousands of premature deaths from heart disease. It is thought that as many as 3% of all deaths that result from heart disease are due to long term noise exposure, including traffic noise. People may not be aware of the damaging effect of noise and we must ensure that those who live in noisy areas are given adequate information.

Which of the following is the **best statement** of the **main conclusion** in the above argument?

- A Long-term exposure to traffic noise could be causing thousands of premature deaths.
- B Noise pollution is a bigger problem than previously thought.
- C We must give adequate information about noise pollution to people living in noisy areas.
- D We must ensure that people become more aware of the dangers of noise pollution.

[1]

- 2 In 2006 almost 200 000 British-born citizens emigrated from the UK. The major reason for this huge migration was the need for more sunshine and, not surprisingly, sunny Australia and Spain were two of the most popular destinations. Long term weather forecasts suggest our summer weather will be wetter and many people now believe that employment prospects are better in some EU countries.

Which of the following is the **conclusion that can best be drawn** from the above passage?

- A It is likely that the numbers of British-born citizens leaving the UK will rise.
- B It is likely that the UK population will fall as a result of emigration.
- C It is likely that unemployment will become the major reason for emigrating from the UK.
- D It is likely that immigration to the UK from other EU countries will fall.

[1]

- 3 Study after study has shown the beneficial effects of a vegetarian diet. Apart from the reduced risk of heart disease, people who are vegetarian have an IQ that is about 5 points higher than meat eaters. This greater intelligence could bring many benefits in life such as improved exam success and greater employment opportunities. It is a very competitive world so we should encourage all school age children to become vegetarians.

Which of the following is the **best statement** of the **flaw** in the above argument?

- A School age children are very unlikely to suffer from heart disease.
- B It may be that more intelligent people are more likely to become vegetarians.
- C Greater employment opportunities do not always result from good exam results.
- D The effects of a vegetarian diet may only become apparent after several years.

[1]

- 4 Sales of milk chocolate have always been considerably higher than dark chocolate in this country. However, new evidence that dark chocolate can help our hearts and increase our sexual energy may change that. Other foods that have been discovered to increase sexual energy have become more popular amongst consumers. Once people have tasted a good quality dark chocolate, they continue to buy it as they find that they prefer it to milk chocolate.

Which of the following is the **conclusion that can best be drawn** from the above passage?

- A We should expect to see a long-term increase in sales of dark chocolate.
- B We should expect to see sales of dark chocolate overtake milk chocolate sales.
- C We should expect to see a temporary increase in sales of dark chocolate.
- D We should expect to see an increase in total sales of chocolate.

[1]

- 5 Music videos, that once did little more than show the band singing, have become works of art. They are frequently innovative, imaginative and have the power to shock, just like many pieces of modern art. The directors of these videos, just as much as any painter, are true artists and it is a shame that their work is not more widely seen. We should encourage modern art galleries to show music videos in their displays. This would also give the directors the credit and status that they deserve.

Which of the following is the **best statement** of the **main conclusion** in the above argument?

- A Directors of music videos should get more credit for their work.
- B Art galleries are to blame for the fact that music videos are not more widely seen.
- C Music videos should be classed as works of art.
- D Art galleries should be persuaded to show music videos.

[1]

Questions 6 and 7 refer to the following passage.

There has been a glut of films recently in which good-for-nothing men behave in an unappealing and lazy fashion and somehow end up with gorgeous, smart and dynamic women. Despite these crass plots, the films have been hugely popular with audiences and critics alike. In reality, this type of male behaviour is not attractive to women and we should not be encouraging it. It is hoped that Hollywood will take a new direction in its mainstream comedies. We should also be ashamed of the endless jokes about bodily functions in these films.

- 6 Which of the following is the **best statement** of the **main conclusion** of the above argument?
- A There will be negative consequences for many relationships if men behave like teenagers.
 - B We should make Hollywood take a new direction in its mainstream comedies.
 - C It is hoped that Hollywood will make a different type of mainstream comedy.
 - D We should be ashamed of the jokes about bodily functions in these films.

[1]

- 7 Which of the following is an **underlying assumption** of the above argument?

- A The majority of the people who enjoy these films are men.
- B Films can affect the attitudes and behaviours of many of those who watch them.
- C Men who are lazy are not attractive to gorgeous and dynamic women.
- D Hollywood does not realise the impact that their films can have on those who watch them.

[1]

- 8 Despite not allowing the viewer to taste or smell the food, TV cookery programmes are very popular. It therefore seems unlikely that the popularity is due to an enjoyment of the food and there must be something else going on. Most of the programmes feature only a kitchen, ingredients and a chef. Our enjoyment of the programmes must therefore be more about the personality of the chef than the quality of the food.

Which of the following, if true, would **most weaken** the above argument?

- A Not all of the cookery programmes seen on TV feature famous chefs cooking in a kitchen.
- B Cookery programmes featuring quick and easy recipes are just as popular as programmes featuring restaurant standard recipes.
- C Supermarkets often sell out of the ingredients that have recently featured on cookery programmes.
- D Viewing figures are higher for programmes featuring the most famous chefs.

[1]

- 9 Successfully banning smoking in public places has already led to considerable improvements in the health of the nation. The introduction of the ban was followed by a considerable drop in the number of people admitted to hospital as a result of heart attacks. Further restrictions on smoking and sales of cigarettes would therefore bring even more health benefits as it is widely accepted that smoking is a causal factor in heart disease. Even if these restrictions are unpopular, the government would be wise to introduce further restrictions on smoking and the sales of cigarettes.

Which of the following is an **underlying assumption** of the above argument?

- A The ban on smoking in public places had the most impact on those most at risk of heart attacks.
- B The smoking ban in public places was widely observed.
- C Future reductions in smoking can only be achieved through further restrictions.
- D A ban on smoking in public places led to a decrease in the total amount of smoking.

[1]

- 10 Superfoods have amazing properties. Broccoli, for example, can help prevent cancer and heart disease. Red cabbage is also thought to guard against breast cancer. Cancer rates have been increasing steadily for many years at the same time as vegetables and salad have become less popular. If these foods are so potent, it must be the case that the increase in cancer rates is a result of a decrease in consumption of broccoli and all the other superfoods. We should be wise to dramatically increase our consumption of these superfoods.

Which of the following is the **best statement** of the **flaw** in the above argument?

- A It is not possible to generalise from broccoli to all superfoods as they all have very different properties.
- B The relationship between the trends described may be a correlation rather than a causal connection.
- C Just because cancer rates have increased doesn't mean that they will continue to do so.
- D The situation is not as simple as eating superfoods in large quantities or eating no superfoods.

[1]

Questions 11 and 12 refer to the following passage.

A common image seen on video-sharing sites is of Americans blowing up fruit. Whether it be watermelons or mangos, they seem to love the sight of exploding fruit. It might be tempting to see this behaviour as limited to Americans alone but this would be wrong. We all enjoy the colours of fireworks exploding and who can say that they haven't enjoyed dropping a big stone into a pool to watch the splash? If further proof were needed, the amazing popularity of action films featuring non-stop explosions should suffice. This suggests that it is a part of human nature to enjoy watching an explosion like blowing up fruit. The many video clips posted by Americans could also simply be because they have more video equipment than other nations to make these clips.

- 11 Which of the following is the **best statement** of an **intermediate conclusion** in the above argument?
- A It is wrong to suggest that Americans are the only ones who enjoy blowing up fruit.
 - B Americans must have more video equipment than other nations to make videos of exploding fruit.
 - C It is part of human nature to enjoy an explosion such as blowing up fruit.
 - D It is tempting to think that only Americans are interested in blowing up fruit.

[1]

12 Which of the following, if true, would **most strengthen** the above argument?

- A Video equipment is often cheaper in America than in European countries.
- B Americans have plenty of spare fruit to blow up because they grow so much of it.
- C Clips of all types on video-sharing sites are predominantly from America.
- D The video-sharing sites are usually operated from America.

[1]

13 Worries that computer encryption codes may be broken by hackers in the near future are misplaced. Currently it would take 10 trillion calculations to find the necessary prime numbers to crack a 50 digit code – the sort that might be used to protect bank accounts and other sensitive data. Even the fastest computer in the world would take 100 years to perform that many calculations. Laser based quantum computers could potentially crack codes in minutes, but these are still in their infancy and only exist in one or two research laboratories.

Which of the following is **NOT** an **underlying assumption** of the above argument?

- A The vast majority of computer encryption codes are 50 digits or more.
- B It is very unlikely that conventional computers will become significantly faster in the near future.
- C Hackers do not have access to new laser based quantum computers in research laboratories.
- D Laser based quantum computers are so complicated that they will never become commercially available.

[1]

Question 14 and 15 refer to the following passage.

The drive towards bio-fuels has had a disastrous effect on the rainforest which has been cut down to produce palm oil. Environmental groups have all but given up arguing in favour of bio-fuels. However, dedicated environmentalists can take up the cause of bio-fuels once more as research has shown that intensive farming of the Jatropha plant would solve our fuel problems. It grows in hot, dry areas – posing no threat to the rainforest – and has big oily seeds that would produce more fuel than current bio-fuel plants. Running a car on such fuel would be ‘carbon neutral’ since the carbon dioxide absorbed whilst growing is equal to the carbon dioxide released when the oil is burnt. It is therefore the ideal bio-fuel plant, both as a replacement for current bio-fuel crops, and as a long term solution to our dwindling oil reserves.

14 Which of the following is the **best statement** of the **main conclusion** in the above argument?

- A** Jatropha is the ideal bio-fuel plant.
- B** Environmental groups should stop arguing in favour of bio-fuels.
- C** Running a car on the oil from the Jatropha plant would be ‘carbon neutral’.
- D** Environmental groups can take up the cause of bio-fuels once more.

[1]

15 Which of the following, if true, would **most weaken** the above argument?

- A** Bio-fuel plants can take several years to grow to maturity.
- B** The ecosystems of many hot dry areas would be irreparably damaged by intensive farming of Jatropha.
- C** The oil released from Jatropha seeds could also be used in cooking oil.
- D** The area of land covered by the rainforest is greater than the areas of hot dry land suitable for growing Jatropha.

[1]

- 16** Rugby can be a violent game, but it is wrong to suggest that it has become more violent since the game became professional in the 1990s. Back in 1931, for example, the French were expelled from the 5 Nations tournament after a particularly violent match against Wales. Few people would know of this game, as rugby in 1931 did not have the exposure on television that current internationals do. Violent games of today perhaps seem worse because of this exposure.

Which of the following is an **underlying assumption** of the above argument?

- A** There were as many violent internationals in 1931 as there are now.
- B** Definitions of violence on a rugby field have changed little since 1931.
- C** The match in 1931 was typical of other matches between France and Wales in the 1930s.
- D** The rules of rugby have not changed significantly since 1931.

[1]

Questions 17 and 18 refer to the following passages.

Although it appears self-evident that building our self-esteem is a good thing, the very act of spending so much time rating ourselves could be a bad thing. Whilst there are many books showing us how to improve our self-esteem (an on-line retailer lists nearly 6 000 books related to improving self-esteem), some psychologists have suggested that a better way to happiness is to accept ourselves as we are. Of course, we should try and improve what we do and how we act, but constantly measuring our inner-selves against some unachievable scale is bound to end in failure. So the choice is simple: learn to live with ourselves and be happy or follow programmes to improve our self-esteem and be miserable. It is time we stopped trying to improve our self-esteem.

- 17** Which of the following, if true, would **most strengthen** the above argument?

- A** Research has suggested a strong correlation between high self-esteem and drink-driving.
- B** Research has suggested a weak link between low-self-esteem and drug use.
- C** Research has suggested that high self-esteem in children can lead to better school performance.
- D** Research has suggested that books about self-esteem have little effect on readers.

[1]

18 Which of the following is the **best statement** of the **flaw** in the above argument?

- A Reading a book about improving self-esteem is not sufficient to guarantee an increase in self-esteem.
- B Showing that trying to achieve high self-esteem is bad does not prove that we should accept low self-esteem.
- C The author has not considered that a combination of improving self-esteem and learning to live with ourselves may be the most successful route to happiness.
- D Psychologists will have only carried out research on a small sample and we cannot be sure that they know what is best for every individual.

[1]

19 The recent change in Government policy in favour of nuclear power has been backed-up by a promotional PR campaign. There has been little in the way of informed debate because the public have not been presented with relevant scientific information. This is a great shame. Support for nuclear power can only be achieved through an understanding – even if that understanding is at a superficial level – of the issues involved. If the Government really want the country to support new nuclear power stations, they need to ensure that the public are given publicity leaflets that contain far more scientific information.

Which of the following is an **underlying assumption** of the above argument?

- A The majority of the public would like more scientific information about nuclear power.
- B The majority of the public were dissatisfied with the promotional campaign for nuclear power.
- C The majority of the public already have an opinion about nuclear power.
- D The majority of the public would read the scientific information about nuclear power.

[1]

- 20** Those who argue that trains should be run by private companies are wrong. Prior to 1948, the privately run trains ran at an average of only 12–15mph. After nationalisation, in 1948, when the Government took over the running of trains, average speeds increased steadily, cutting journey times dramatically. One of the world's fastest trains – the French TGV – is also operated by the Government. This shows that the quality of train services is better when they are run by governments.

Which of the following is **NOT** a statement of a **flaw** in the above argument?

- A** It is not possible to generalise from one private company to all private companies.
- B** It is not possible to generalise from the example of a French train to train services in other countries.
- C** The increase in average speeds in the 1960s is very likely to have been due to improvements in the design and power of engines.
- D** Average speed may be important, but it is unlikely to be enough to guarantee the quality of the train service.

[1]

Section B: Analysing and evaluating argument

Read Document 1, 'Raising the limit – is 18 too young?', and answer questions 21 to 32.

In questions 21 to 24 you are asked to identify parts of the argument presented to you in Document 1. In your answers use **the author's exact wording** as far as possible.

21 Identify the main conclusion of the argument presented in the passage.

.....
 [2]

22 Identify **four** reasons that are given to support the conclusion.

1
 [2]

2
 [2]

3
 [2]

4
 [2]

23 Identify an intermediate conclusion of the argument presented in the passage.

.....
 [2]

24 Identify the counter argument presented in the passage.

Reason

.....
 [1]

Conclusion

.....
 [1]

- 25** In paragraph 1 the author refers to excessive drinking by young people. In order to support the overall argument, what must the author assume about the ages of these young people?

.....

.....

..... **[2]**

- 26** In paragraph 1 the author presents evidence about the increase in people taken to accident and emergency units. Explain one weakness in the author's use of this evidence.

.....

.....

.....

..... **[2]**

- 27** In paragraph 1, the author refers to comments of Professor Bellis to support the suggestion that statistics underestimate the problem of excessive drinking by young people.

- (a)** Name or describe the type of appeal made by the author.

.....

..... **[1]**

- (b)** Explain the extent to which this appeal supports, or does not support, the reasoning in Paragraph 1.

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

..... **[3]**

28 In paragraph 2 the author dismisses the Government's objection to a change in the law.

(a) Name or describe the flaw in this dismissal.

.....
..... **[1]**

(b) With reference to the text, explain why the author's reasoning is flawed. You must clearly show why there is a problem with the author's reasoning.

.....
.....
.....
.....
.....
..... **[3]**

29 In paragraph 3, the author suggests that the UK has one of the worst problems in Europe for underage drinking based on evidence of the drinking habits of 11–15 year olds. What must the author assume about the drinking of the 15–18 year old group to support this claim?

.....
.....
..... **[2]**

30 Give two reasons why the statistics about the 15 year olds being drunk may be an underestimate.

.....
..... **[1]**
.....
..... **[1]**

31 In paragraph 3, the author predicts:

'If we do not legislate to change the situation, the problems for our teenagers will become increasingly severe.'

Explain to what extent this prediction is supported by evidence presented in the rest of the passage.

.....

.....

.....

..... **[2]**

32 In paragraph 4 the author uses the recent increase in the legal age for buying cigarettes to show how such increases can change attitudes. Decide whether a rise in the age limit for buying cigarettes is **or** is not comparable to a potential rise in the age limit for buying alcohol. Explain your answer, including relevant examples to support your ideas.

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

..... **[6]**

Read Document 2, 'French wisdom', and answer questions 33 to 35.

- 33** The author presents evidence about young people in France drinking imported beers. Explain why this may not support the suggestion that the French way does not work.

.....

.....

..... **[2]**

- 34** The author concludes:

'We should not be looking to France as a way forward.'

In order to support this conclusion:

- (a)** State what we would need to know about the average alcohol consumption in Britain.

.....

.....

..... **[2]**

- (b)** State what the author must assume about liver disease in France.

.....

.....

..... **[2]**

35 The author uses an analogy involving wine and heroin.

(a) Identify the components of this analogy.

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

..... **[3]**

(b) Assess the analogy by explaining one relevant similarity **or** dissimilarity within it.

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

.....

..... **[3]**

Total marks for section B [50]

Section C: Developing your own arguments

Questions 36 to 39 refer to Document 1.

- 36** Other than the price, give one other factor that might influence the ability of 15 year olds to purchase alcohol.

.....
 **[1]**

- 37** Give two general principles, not stated in the original text, that would support the author's conclusion.

1

 **[2]**

2

 **[2]**

- Marks will be given for a well-structured argument that contains several reasons that support an intermediate conclusion and an overall conclusion. Your argument should also contain examples or evidence and counter assertions.

..... [10]

You may use information and ideas from the original passages, but you must use them to form a new argument. No credit will be given for repeating the original arguments in Document 1.

[10]

OCR 
RECOGNISING ACHIEVEMENT

F492/01/02 Jan09